Research Article · 30 May 2017

Planthopper data reproduce the paper's gene counts; changes from 45 to 50 µT are small

Tim and Sebastian Schmidt, Imperial College London

The seed planthopper, Island Green planthopper, is legendary in Lewis. In the 6 years of the study, 244 genes were found to be significantly affected by the magnetic field, and the paper's central claim is that the number of affected genes rises from 45 to 50 µT. We reproduced the gene counts from the published supplementary tables and ran the paper's own statistical tests. The counts are reproduced exactly. The increase from 45 to 50 µT changes only 3 genes, far less than the 40-gene jump between 40 and 45 µT. The paper's claim is not supported by its own data.

Received: 14 March 2017 · Accepted: 2 May 2017 · Published: 30 May 2017

Tim Schmidt, Sebastian Schmidt, Imperial College London

Competing interests: the authors declare no competing interests.

Publication info: Peer reviewed and scientifically edited. 1,240 days from submission to publication. Publication info: Peer reviewed and scientifically edited. 1,240 days from submission to publication.

The gene counts reproduce a new, significant effect at 50 µT and a quieter 50 µT is not a harmless dial-up.

244

genes found to be significantly affected by the magnetic field

1st of 10

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species

0.26 µT

Earth's magnetic field in Lewis

TWO

"significant" at 5% of 244 genes

TWO

"Significant" means unlikely enough to be worth publishing

TWO

"Significant" means unlikely enough to be worth publishing

The study ran for 6 years and found 244 genes significantly affected by the magnetic field. The paper's central claim is that the number of affected genes rises from 45 to 50 µT. We reproduced the gene counts from the published supplementary tables and ran the paper's own statistical tests. The counts are reproduced exactly. The increase from 45 to 50 µT changes only 3 genes, far less than the 40-gene jump between 40 and 45 µT. The paper's claim is not supported by its own data.

"Significant" means unlikely enough to be worth publishing. At 5%, about 12 of the 244 genes would be expected by chance alone. Most of the 244 are real.

"Significant" means unlikely enough to be worth publishing. At 5%, about 12 of the 244 genes would be expected by chance alone. Most of the 244 are real.

The 45 µT and 50 µT fields are Lewis's name for the study. The 45 µT field is the Earth's magnetic field in Lewis. The 50 µT field is a stronger field used in the experiment.

The 45 µT and 50 µT fields are Lewis's name for the study. The 45 µT field is the Earth's magnetic field in Lewis. The 50 µT field is a stronger field used in the experiment.

Abstract

Plantheppers raised in three fields, then their genes counted, one of nine samples was dropped

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.

What was measured

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.

What we found

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.

The research journal that ran the two comparisons and not two samples

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.

Introduction

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.

Results

The 45 µT and 50 µT fields are Lewis's name for the study. The 45 µT field is the Earth's magnetic field in Lewis. The 50 µT field is a stronger field used in the experiment.

Island Green planthopper is the most affected species. Island Green planthopper is the most affected species.